

ENGINEERING

Tel 919.647.0000 Fax 919.715.0067

MIKE CAUSEY, INSURANCE COMMISSIONER & STATE FIRE MARSHAL BRIAN TAYLOR, CHIEF STATE FIRE MARSHAL

January 6, 2022

Kenneth Michael Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP One West Fourth Street Winston-Salem, NC 27101

RE: Stepped Aisle and Stairway Riser Uniformity 2018 NCBC, Sections 1029.13.2.2.1 and 1011.5.4

Mr. Michael:

This letter is in response to your request for formal interpretation dated December 16, 2021 that was received in NCDOI by email on that same date. Your request for formal interpretation states:

"Please confirm the following:

- 1. Stepped Aisles
 - a. Please identify which runs of steps labeled A-W on Exhibit D are "Stepped Aisles".
 - b. To the extent there are Stepped Aisles on the Project, the applicable Code reference is the following:

1029.13.2.2.1 Construction Tolerances

"The tolerance between adjacent risers on a stepped aisle that were designed to be equal height shall not exceed 3/16 inch (4.8 mm). Where the stepped aisle is designed in accordance with Exception 1 of Section 1029.13.2.2, the stepped aisle shall be constructed so that each riser of unequal height, determined in the direction of descent, is not more than 3/8 inch (9.5 mm) in height different from adjacent risers where stepped aisle treads are less than 22 inches (560 mm) in depth and 3/4 inch (19.1 mm) in height different from adjacent risers where stepped aisles treads are 22 inches (560 mm) or greater in depth."

- c. Even though the tolerance for adjacent riser heights is 3/16 Inch per Section 1029.13.2.2.1, a tolerance of 3/8inch is deemed to be in compliance with Code.
- 2. Stairways
 - a. Please identify which runs of steps labeled A-W on Exhibit D are "Stairways."
 - b. To the extend there are Stairways on the Project, please confirm the applicable Code reference is Section 1011.5.4 Dimension Uniformity, to which: "Stair treads and risers shall be uniform size and shape. The tolerance between the largest and smallest riser height or between the largest and the smallest tread depth shall not exceed 3/8 inch (9.5 mm) in any flight of stairs;" with Exception 1 whereby: "Stairways connecting stepped aisles to

OFFICE OF STATE FIRE MARSHAL

cross aisles or concourses shall be permitted to comply with the dimensional nonuniformity in Section 1029.13.2."

- 3. Curved Steps at Stage (labeled O through W on Exhibit D)
 - a. Based on as-built survey (Exhibit C), please identify which runs of steps are not in compliance with 2018 NC Building Code.
 - b. For purposes of Code compliance, is it proper to assess all runs labeled O through W on Exhibit D, or just the ends with handrail (labeled O through W on Exhibit D?"

Remarks:

Code sections noted in this letter are referring to the 2018 edition of the NC Building Code unless otherwise noted.

Attachment A is comprised of the request for formal interpretation as well as all supporting information and exhibits submitted with the request.

Attachment B is a drawing of the section through the site as requested by Carl Martin on December 28, 2021. The drawing was provided on December 30, 2021.

Attachment C is a photograph of the seating area of the "as-built" condition taken from the viewpoint of the performance area. The photo is of the left side of the seating area but portrays the condition of the entire seating area.

Attachment D is a photograph of the performance area taken from the viewpoint of the seating area.

Attachment E is a photograph of the walkway passing behind the seating area and providing access to the seating area as well a path of travel not related to the seating area. The seating (steps) seen to the left of the walkway appear to have been existing prior to the project in question.

3/16 inch equals 0.015625 feet.

3/8 inch equals 0.03125 feet.

Code Analysis:

Chapter 2 defines "Aisle" as follows:

Aisle. An unenclosed exit access component that defines and provides a path of egress travel.

Comment: Normally all paths of egress within an assembly seating area would be an aisle.

Chapter 2 defines "Exit Access" as follows:

Exit Access. That portion of a means of egress system that leads from any occupied portion of a building or structure to an exit.

Comment: Aisles used for egress would be exit access aisles. Steps A through N on Exhibit C are, therefore, "stepped aisles" and Section 1029.13.2 will apply.

The text of Section 1029.13.2.2.1 is included in the request for formal interpretation shown above.

Comments: 1029.13.2.2.1 references Section 1029.13.2.2, exception #1.

Section 1029.13.2.2 reads in part as follows:

1029.13.2.2 Risers. Where the gradient of stepped aisles is to be the same as the gradient of adjoining seating areas, the riser height shall be not less that 4 inches (102 mm) nor more than 8 inches (203 mm) and shall be uniform within each flight.

Exceptions:

1. Riser height nonuniformity shall be limited to the extent necessitated by changes in the gradient of the adjoining seating area to maintain adequate sightlines. Where nonuniformities exceed 3/16 inch (4.8 mm) between adjacent risers, the exact location of such nonuniformities shall be indicated with a distinctive marking stripe on each tread at the nosing or leading edge adjacent to the nonuniform risers. Such stripe shall be not less than 1 inch (25 mm), and not more than 2 inches (51 mm), wide. The edge marking stripe shall be distinctively different from the contrasting marking stripe.

Comments: Based on Attachment B below it does not appear that a 3/8 inch riser tolerance is needed for this site to "maintain adequate sightlines".

Chapter 2 defines "Stairway" as follows:

Stairway. One or more flights of stairs, either exterior or interior, with the necessary landings and platforms connecting them, to form a continuous and uninterrupted passage from one level to another.

Comment: The steps from the performance area to the cross aisle are for egress or convenience and therefore qualify as an exit access stairway and not a "stepped aisle". Steps A, G, H and I provide access from a walkway down to the seating area and therefore appear to also be exit access stairways.

Section 1011.5 states in part:

1011.1 General. Stairways serving occupied portions of a building shall comply with the requirements of Sections 1011.2 through 1011.13.

Comment: Steps labeled A, G, H, I and O through W on Exhibit D would qualify as stairways and require compliance with Section 1011.5.

Section 1011.5.4 states in part:

1011.5.4 Dimensional uniformity. Stair treads and risers shall be of uniform size and shape. The tolerance between the largest and smallest riser height or between the largest and smallest tread depth shall not exceed 3/8 inch (9.5 mm) in any flight of stairs.

Comment: Steps labeled O through W on Exhibit D can have a tolerance of 3/8 inch between the largest and smallest riser. With a curved stair the intent is to meet the uniformity in any likely path of travel which, in the case of the plan shown in Exhibit D of Attachment A, would be any path directly down the steps at a 90 degree angle to the top or bottom landings.

Conclusions:

- 1a. Steps labeled B through F and J through N on Exhibit D appear to be "stepped aisles".
- 1b. Section 1029.13.2.2.1 is the correct reference for addressing allowed riser height tolerance for stepped aisles.

- 1c. Section 1029.13.2.2.1 limits the riser height uniformity tolerance for stepped aisles to 3/16 inch unless an increase to 3/8 inch is required to "maintain adequate sightlines" for adjacent seating served by the stepped aisle. Attachment B below does not demonstrate a need for a 3/8 inch tolerance to maintain adequate sightlines for adjacent seating; therefore, the uniformity tolerance is limited by Section 1029.13.2.2.1 to 3/16 inch for the plan shown in Exhibit C.
- 2a. Steps labeled O through W on Exhibit D appear to be stairways providing egress and convenience for the performance area. Steps labeled A, G, H and I appear to be stairways providing access from an adjacent walkway to the seating area.
- 2b. Section 1011.5.4 is the applicable code section for steps labeled A, G, H, I and O through W on Exhibit D. The allowed maximum tolerance from the smallest to the greatest riser height is 3/8 inch.
- 3a. Any riser difference greater than 0.03125 feet (3/8 inch) of the smallest to the largest riser is not compliant with the applicable code requirement (ref. Section 1011.5.4).

Steps O are in compliance.

Steps P are in compliance.

Steps Q are not compliant because the difference in riser height from 0.50 to 0.56 is 0.06 feet which exceeds the allowed 0.03125 feet.

Steps R are not compliant because the difference in riser height from 0.49 to 0.54 is 0.05 feet which exceeds the allowed 0.03125 feet.

Steps S are not compliant because the difference in riser height from 0.51 to 0.57 is 0.06 feet which exceeds the allowed 0.03125 feet.

Steps T are not compliant because the difference in riser height from 0.49 to 0.56 is 0.07 feet which exceeds the allowed 0.03125 feet

Steps U are not compliant because the difference in riser height from 0.50 to 0.54 is 0.04 feet which exceeds the allowed 0.03125 feet.

Steps V are not compliant because the difference in riser height from 0.49 to 0.53 is 0.04 feet which exceeds the allowed 0.03125 feet.

Steps W are not compliant because the difference in riser height from 0.50 to 0.54 is 0.04 feet which exceeds the allowed 0.03125 feet.

Summary:

- Steps O and P comply with Section 1011.5.4.
- Steps Q thru W do not comply with Section 1011.5.4.
- Steps S, T and V could be made compliant if the bottom riser is marked as required by Section 1011.5.4.1.
- Steps U could be made compliant if the top riser is marked as required by Section 1011.5.4.1.
- 3b. Because steps O through W are all available to be traversed, Steps O through W must all comply with Section 1011 Stairways.

Please call if you have comments or questions.

Sincerely,

Carl Martin, RA Deputy Commissioner Division Chief of Engineering

cc: File

Bridget Herring, Chair – BCC Danny Priest, Vice-Chair – BCC Jason Shepherd, Chairman – BCC Fire Code Standing Committee Thomas O'Kelley, Director, Rowan County Bldg Inspections Scott Lowder, Sr. Inspector, Rowan County Bldg Inspections Jonathan Chamberlain, Chief Officer, RCCC Jim Atkinson, Project Manager, RCCC James Bernier, Jr., Special Deputy Attorney General, NCDOJ Jeff Hinkle, NC SCO Monitor Russell Killen,counsel for McAdams Nick Lowe, RLA McAdams Robert Attardo, counsel for Labella Andrew Chapin, counsel for WC Construction Bryan Badeaux, Surety Claims Counsel, Philadelphia Insurance

ATTACHMENT A

womblebonddickinson.com

December 16, 2021

Via Electronic Mail Mike.causey@ncdoi.gov

Marshal Mike Causey Commissioner of Insurance Engineering Section of the North Carolina Department of Insurance 430 North Salisbury Street 1201 Mail Service Center Raleigh, NC 27699-1201



One West Fourth Street Winston-Salem, NC 27101

t: 336.721.3600 f: 336.721.3660

Kenneth R. Michael, Esquire Partner Direct Dial: 336-721-3644 E-mail: Ken.Michael@wbd-us.com

Re: Appeal (Request) for Formal Interpretation (N.C. Gen. Stats. § 160D-1127) Rowan Cabarrus Community College Outdoor Classroom Phase II 1333 S. Jake Alexander Blvd., Salisbury, NC

Commissioner Causey,

Womble Bond Dickinson is counsel for Rowan Cabarrus Community College. Pursuant to N.C. Gen. Stats. § 160D-1127, Rowan Cabarrus Community College ("Owner"), submits this appeal or request for a Formal Interpretation of the Rowan County Building Inspection Department's interpretation of the NC State Building Code relating to the as-built construction compliance of steps and stairs at the Rowan Cabarrus Community College Outdoor Classroom Phase II project in Salisbury, NC ("Project"). Please find attached the following key documents:

Exhibit A	Inspection Worksheet (INSP-420557-2021) by Scott Lowder of the Rowan County Building Inspection Department, dated December 7, 2021;
Exhibit B	December 15, 2021 11:44 AM clarification email from Thomas O'Kelly, Director
	of Rowan County Building Inspections;
Exhibit C	As-built spot elevation survey, dated August 24, 2021, by Douglas Surveying,
	PLLC, with subsequently added text of calculations in red font by the Designer,
	Nick Lowe, of McAdams; and
Exhibit D	For reference purposes only, Location Key for Stair Runs labeling on the as-built spot elevation survey all the runs of stairs on the project with letters A-W.

The Project is to comply with 2018 NC State Building Code. The Owner is concerned that the spot elevations on the as-built survey (Exhibit C) reveal steps and stairs with risers that do not comply with the tolerance between adjacent steps (we think 3/16") and run of steps which are labeled A-W on Exhibit D (we think 3/8").

Please confirm (or clarify) the following:

Stepped Aisles

- a. Please identify which runs of steps labeled A-W on Exhibit D are "Stepped Aisles."
- b. To the extent there are Stepped Aisles on the Project, the applicable Code reference is the following:

Womble Bond Dickinson (US) LLP is a member of Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited, which consists of independent and autonomous iaw firms providing services in the US, the UK, and elsewhere around the world. Each Womble Bond Dickinson entity is a separate legal entity and is not responsible for the acts or omissions of, nor can bind or obligate, another Womble Bond Dickinson entity. Womble Bond Dickinson (International) Limited does not practice law. Please see <u>www.womblebonddickinson.com/us/legal-notice</u> for further details.

Marshal Mike Causey December 16, 2021 Page 2 of 8

1029.13.2.2.1 Construction Tolerances

"The tolerance between adjacent risers on a stepped aisle that were designed to be equal height shall not exceed 3/16 inch (4.8 mm). Where the stepped aisle is designed in accordance with Exception 1 of Section 1029.13.2.2, the stepped aisle shall be constructed so that each riser of unequal height, determined in the direction of descent, is not more than 3/8 inch (9.5 mm) in height different from adjacent risers where stepped aisle treads are less than 22 inches (560 mm) in depth and 3/4 inch (19.1 mm) in height different from adjacent risers where stepped aisle treads are 22 inches (560 mm) or greater in depth."

- c. Even though the tolerance for adjacent riser heights is 3/16 Inch per Section 1029.13.2.2.1, a tolerance of 3/8 inch is deemed to be in compliance with Code.
- 2. Stairways
 - a. Please identify which runs of steps labeled A-W on Exhibit D are "Stairways."
 - b. To the extent there are Stairways on the Project, please confirm the applicable Code reference is Section 1011.5.4 Dimensional Uniformity, to which: "Stair treads and risers shall be of uniform size and shape. The tolerance between the largest and smallest riser height or between the largest and smallest tread depth shall not exceed 3/8 inch (9.5 mm) in any flight of stairs;" with Exception 1 whereby: "Stairways connecting stepped aisles to cross aisles or concourses shall be permitted to comply with the dimensional nonuniformity in Section 1029.13.2."
- 3. Curved Steps at Stage (labeled O through W on Exhibit D)
 - a. Based on the as-built survey (Exhibit C), please identify which runs of steps are not in compliance with 2018 NC Building Code.
 - b. For purposes of Code compliance, is it proper to assess all runs labeled O through W on Exhibit D, or just the ends with handrails (labeled O and W on Exhibit D?

Please note this Appeal (Request) is separate and apart from any independent professional duty of the design professionals on the Project, McAdams and Labella Associates. Please do not hesitate to let us know if you need any additional documents or information by contacting our design professional of record for the Project:

Nick Lowe RLA, ASLA, NRPA McAdams direct 980.729.6072 mobile 704.239.5088 <u>nlowe@mcadamsco.com</u> 3430 Toringdon Way, Suite 110, Charlotte, NC 28277

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

WOMBLE BOND DICKINSON (US) LLP

Marshal Mike Causey December 16, 2021 Page 3 of 8

Kenneth R. Michael

KRM: kwb

CC:	Thomas O'Kelly, Director, Rowan County Bldg Inspections, Thomas.okelly@rowancountync.gov
	Scott Lowder, Sr.Inspector, Rowan County Bldg Inspections, Jessie.Lowder@rowancountync.gov
	Jonathan Chamberlain, Chief Officer, RCCC, jonathan.chamberlain@rccc.edu
	Jim Atkinson, Project Manager, RCCC, jim.atkinson@rccc.edu
	James Bernier, Jr., Special Deputy Attorney General, NCDOJ, JBernier@ncdoj.gov
	Jeff Hinkle, NC SCO Monitor, Jeffrey.Hinkle@doa.nc.gov
	Russell Killen, Esq., counsel for McAdams, russellkillen@parkerpoe.com
	Nick Lowe, RLA, McAdams, nlowe@mcadamsco.com
	Robert Attardo, Esq., counsel for Labella, RAttardo@LaBellaPC.com
	Andrew Chapin, Esq., counsel for WC Construction, AChapin@cgspllc.com
	Bryan Badeaux, Esq. Sr. Surety Claims Counsel, Philadelphia Insurance, Bryan.Badeaux@phly.com
Atta	chments:
Exhi	bit A Inspection Worksheet (INSP-420557-2021) by Scott Lowder of the Rowan County Building Inspection Department, dated December 7, 2021;
Exhi	bit B December 15, 2021 11:44 AM clarification email from Thomas O'Kelly, Director of Rowan County Building Inspections;
Exhi	bit C As-built spot elevation survey, dated August 24, 2021, by Douglas Surveying, PLLC, with subsequently added text of calculations in red font by the Designer, Nick Lowe, of McAdams; and
Exhi	bit D Location Key for Stair Runs labeling on the as-built spot elevation survey all the runs of stairs on the project with letters A-W.

Marshal Mike Causey December 16, 2021 Page 4 of 8

Exhibit A

Inspection Worksheet (INSP-420557-2021) by Scott Lowder of the Rowan County Building Inspection Department, dated December 7, 2021

Phone: (704) 216-	ailding Inspections 4 8619 Fax: (704) 216-2	102 North Main Stre 7986	et Suite 207 Salis	bury, NC	
Case Number:	COMM-04-20-073118	3	Case Module:	Permit	
nspection Date:	Tue Dec 7, 2021		inspection Status:	Failed	
nspector:	Lowder, Scott		Inspection Type:	Bidg Final - Res	
Job Address:	1333 S JAKE ALEXA Salisbury, NC, 28146	NDER BIVI LVL 1	Parcel Number:	063 068	
Contact Type		Company Name	5	Name	
Dwner		ROWAN COUNTY			
Contractor Genera	1	"WC Construction C	ompany, LLC	Cockerham, Jr., William	
Owner		ROCC			
Checklist Nem					Status
 No change Sections of st stage. These uniform. The 2. Need to tes 3. Need to have 	vis - Inspector Commen s from previous inspect leps in the stepped Ais Aisle steps are design construction tolerances Legress lighting in the re- engineers data for br	ion. les are not to code . ed to be equal with th per 1029.13.2.2.1 % aisles per the the pre- sition plate sealing n	1 set on the left , 2 on he gradient sealing an or a design of equal to vicus inspection report ot installed per previou	the right looking down to the eas. The seeting areas are lorances , needs to be mee rl. us inspection.	Paned all t.
nepector Commer 1. No change Sections of st stage. These uniform. The 2. Need to tes 3. Need to hav	vis - Inspector Commen s from previous inspect leps in the stepped Aisi Aisia steps are design construction tolerances t egress fighting in the engineers data for br	res lon. les are not to code . ed to be equal with th per 1029.13.2.2.1 is alses per the the pre- sition plate sealing n	1 set on the left, 2 on he gradient sealing an or a design of equal to vicus inspection report ot installed per previo	the right looking down to the eas. The seating areas are illerances, needs to be mee 1. us inspection.	Paned all t.

Marshal Mike Causev December 16, 2021 Page 5 of 8

Exhibit B December 15, 2021 11:44 AM clarification email from Thomas O'Kelly, Director of Rowan County Building Inspections

From: O'Kelly, Thomas < Thomas.O'Kelly@rowancountync.gov> Sent: Wednesday, December 15, 2021 11:44 AM To: Lowe, Nick <nlowe@mcadamsco.com> Cc: Lowder, Jessie Scott < Jessie.Lowder@rowancountync.gov>; Jim Atkinson <jim.atkinson@rccc.edu>; Danny Carpenter <danny.carpenter@rccc.edu>; David Malcolm <malcolm@mcadamsco.com>; Samuel Bush <samuel@wcconstructionco.com>; William Cockerham <william@wcconstructionco.com> Subject: RE: RCCC OLC Phase II

Gentlemen.

Good morning I hope all is well. After several correspondences email and phone with you all concerning the riser heights at the RCCC Outdoor Learning Center we have received from Land Surveyor Russell Douglas a more accurate measurement of the stair riser which show risers exceeding the tolerances of 3/8". Rowan County has field measured with tape measures and determined the stairs exceed 3/8" if you feel this Rowan County inspection is incorrect you may contact the Department of Insurance Building Division for a formal interpretation.



Rowan Thomas O'Kelly | Director COUNTY Rowan County Building Inspections 402 N. Main St. Salisbury, NC 28144 NORTH CAROLINA [p] 704-216-8612 [c] 704-202-4132 [f] 704-216-7986 Be an original. Thomas.okelly@rowancountync.gov www.rowancountync.gov

From: Nick Lowe <nlowe@mcadamsco.com> Sent: Tuesday, December 14, 2021 3:59 PM To: O'Kelly, Thomas < Thomas.O'Kelly@rowancountync.gov> Cc: Lowder, Jessie Scott < Jessie.Lowder@rowancountync.gov>; Jim Atkinson <jim.atkinson@rccc.edu>; Danny Carpenter <danny.carpenter@rccc.edu>; David Malcolm <malcolm@mcadamsco.com>; Samuel Bush <samuel@wcconstructionco.com>; William Cockerham <william@wcconstructionco.com> Subject: RCCC OLC Phase II

Thomas

Marshal Mike Causey December 16, 2021 Page 6 of 8

I hope you have been doing well. Upon review of the most recent inspection report dated December 7th, 2021 for the above mentioned project, we would like to clarify whether particular sets of stairs are approved or disapproved or whether there was a general determination that the stairs do not meet code. Also, I understand that you may need a copy of the survey elevations for the stairs that were taken by WCCC. I have attached that for your convenience.

Thanks,



E-mail correspondence to and from this address may be subject to the North Carolina Public Records Law and may be disclosed to third parties by an authorized state official. (NCGS.Ch.132)

Marshal Mike Causey December 16, 2021 Page 7 of 8

Exhibit C

As-built spot elevation survey, dated August 24, 2021, by Douglas Surveying, PLLC, with subsequently added text of calculations in red font by the Designer, Nick Lowe, of McAdams

[See attachment]



Marshal Mike Causey December 16, 2021 Page 8 of 8





ATTACHMENT B



ATTACHMENT C



ATTACHMENT D



ATTACHMENT E

